

THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE BLENDED LEARNING SYSTEM FOR THE TRAINING OF THE GOVERNMENT ADMINISTRATION STANDARD OPERATIONAL PROCEDURE DEVELOPER

P-ISSN: 2089-4341 | E-ISSN: 2655-9633

<https://uia.e-journal.id/akademika/article/view/896>

DOI: 10.34005/akademika.v9i02.896

Submitted: 2020-07-22 Reviewed: 2020-11-25 Published: 2020-11-30

Mulya Nanda Hariandja

harandjatp@yahoo.com

Universitas Negeri Padang-Indonesia

Abstract: *The implementation of face-to-face education and training is often constrained by issues of curriculum, infrastructure, opportunities and time. Curricula that should be the basis for conducting training are often not implemented well with consideration of budget efficiency. This study aims to overcome these problems by developing training for the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) Developer of the Government Administration with a valid, practical and efficient blended learning model to improve human resources. This study used a blended learning model which consists of 6 stages from curriculum development and teaching materials, stage to evaluation stage. The results of the average product validity gets a value of 93.59% which indicate the blended learning were very valid. On the average practicality of facilitator responses 82.69% of the which indicated the model is very practical. The effectiveness result between pre-test and post-test showed increasing score 43,26 points and the skills test results showed an average 84.61% which is effective. In conclusion, the development of the blended learning system for training of S.O.P Developer of government administration at the center of human resource development is valid, practical, and effective. Thus it can be applied as model of training for state officer in the future.*

Keywords: ASN, blended learning, training and education, SOP of government administration.

Abstract: *Pelaksanaan pendidikan dan pelatihan tatap muka seringkali terkendala permasalahan kurikulum, sarana prasarana, kesempatan dan waktu. Kendala anggaran yang besar untuk akomodasi dan konsumsi menambah kesulitan bagi aparatur untuk mengikuti pendidikan dan pelatihan. Kurikulum yang harusnya menjadi landasan dalam pelaksanaan pelatihan sering tidak dilaksanakan dengan baik dengan pertimbangan efisiensi anggaran. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengatasi masalah tersebut dengan mengembangkan diklat penyusunan S.O.P Administrasi Pemerintah dengan model blended learning untuk meningkatkan sumber daya manusia yang valid, praktis dan efektif. Penelitian ini menggunakan model pembelajaran bauran yang merupakan modifikasi pendapat Thorne (2003) terdiri dari tahapan berikut: pengembangan kurikulum dan bahan ajar, penjelasan kepada mentor atau atasan pegawai, pengembangan web*

dan uji coba kelompok kecil, perbaikan dan uji coba dan kelompok sedang, pelaksanaan pembelajaran, dan evaluasi. Hasil penelitian didapatkan dari uji validitas 3 aspek yaitu aspek media, materi dan bahasa. Selanjutnya uji praktikalitas respon fasilitator dan respon peserta diklat. Sedangkan uji efektivitas dilihat dari hasil uji keterampilan peserta diklat. Hasil rata-rata validitas produk mendapat nilai 93,59% kategori sangat valid. Rata-rata praktikalitas respon fasilitator 82,69% kategori sangat praktis. Hasil uji efektivitas dari hasil uji keterampilan didapatkan rata-rata 84,61% kategori sangat efektif. Berdasarkan data di atas dapat disimpulkan bahwa Pengembangan diklat penyusunan S.O.P administrasi pemerintah dengan blended learning pada pusat pengembangan sumber daya manusia adalah valid, praktis, dan efektif untuk digunakan dalam pendidikan dan latihan.

Keywords: ASN, blended learning, pelatihan dan pendidikan, SOP penyelenggaraan pemerintahan.

INTRODUCTION

The ability to carry out work which is called competency, thus the better competency of state civil officer the better of work results can be achieved. State officer competencies are generally contained in Government Regulation (PP) No. 11 of 2017 concerning Management of the State Civil Officer (SCO) which mandates good competency of the state civil officer. The competencies mentioned are managerial, socio-cultural, leadership and technical competencies. The competencies can be acquired not only y through formal education of the previous SCO has been achieved, however should be obtained through seminars, technical guidance; and education and training (Peraturan Pemerintah RI No. 11, 2017).

SCO competency development cannot be carried out by the agency where the SCO work. This is due to the organizers or agencies implementing the training must get three accreditations from the education advisory namely State Administration Agency. In addition, unavailability of infrastructure for implementation such as places, accommodation and committees are another major obstacles for training implementation. Furthermore, not all agencies have a developed curriculum. Another important obstacle is the speaker or trainer must come from curriculum developer agency and the speaker's role must be approved by curriculum agency. The impact is that an agency must send its SCO to conduct training outside its origin agency with payment from Non-Tax State Revenue (PNBP) in accordance with article 8 point 2 of Law Number 20 of 1997 (Undang-Undang RI No. 20, 1997). PP Number 63 of 2013. This regulation states the nominal amount that must be paid for developing 4 competencies in the form of technical guidance for general functional/ implementation officer for 3 (three) days carried out outside the State Personnel Agency Office is Rp. 1,838,000 (Peraturan Pemerintah RI No. 63, 2016).

The nominal amount that must be provided by each region is very

significant. This can be illustrated in the following example, the Government of West Sumatra Province using the data of the National Personnel Agency through its website until the end of 2016 had 109,392 people and 37% functional general or technical implementing officer which was around 41,492 people. Thus, the West Sumatra Province had to allocate a budget for 41,492 people X Rp. 1,838,000 which is Rp. 76,262,296,000. This vast amount of money could have allocated to build a new road that covering around 492,015 m² which is very significantly useful for citizen (based on the conversion of the asphalt price from CV. Sarana Mega Sakti in 2017-2018) (Saranapengaspalan.com, 2018).

The time needed in the implementation of education and training activities is around 3 days or 20JP in accordance with PP Number 11 Year 2017 Article 203 paragraph 4 (Peraturan Pemerintah RI No. 11, 2017). The length of time the training makes the manager or leader wants a class that takes less time or more concise material, so that officers can complete their main task (Smilanich & Wilson, 2005). Field phenomena findings often show that many education and training programs that should be carried out 9 hours per day are summarized into shorter time at the request of participants so that participants can travel. This certainly raises the problem of the incompleteness of the training, so that competence could not be completely achieved (Smilanich & Wilson, 2005).

The solution for the cost constraints, time that can interfere with the main tasks of ASN, and the practice of traveling in the middle of a learning task is by conducting training through e-learning. E-learning learning models are able to summarize the need for classrooms, so that the time and place of learning is more flexible (Hoffman, 2014). This has an impact on reducing the budget for sending members out and minimizing disruption of work assignments due to training because participants can learn without leaving work.

However, E-learning is considered ineffective because it only focuses on achieving competencies and material. Studies in China show that the face-to-face learning model is better than e-learning because in Asian cultures face-to-face has a role in motivating and guiding student to achieve the goals of learning (Zhong, Zhang, Li, & Liu, 2016).

The learning method that can facilitate those issues is blended learning model. Blended learning is a combination of various forms of instructional technology (video recording, CD-ROM, web-based training, film) with face-to-face training with instructors (Watson, 2008). Blended learning combines a learning which is made according to the needs of learners and the combination of learning using technology with face to face interaction with personal instructor who can boost learning with motivational advice and with personal mentoring (Thorne, 2003). Peran pembimbing atau instruktur dalam kelas pekerja dilakukan oleh atasan pekerja tersebut (Thorne, 2003). The role of the supervisor or instructor in the working class

is carried out by the employee's supervisor (Thorne, 2003). Blended training can facilitate the on Job training that means a person learns the work by actually carrying out the work and during the program, participants are required to consult with their superiors as part of learning (Swasto, 2011). Two studies in Indonesia and Vietnam in the application of blended learning systems show that blended learning learning methods can effectively increase student competencies along with reducing the cost and time of conducting training (Nguyen, 2015; Prayitno, 2015).

Based on the above discussion this study was carried out to apply the blended training method in staff of civil officer in government agencies. This study aims to test the level of validity, practicality, and effectiveness of the blended learning model s in the human resource training of S.O.P Administration Developer in government agencies. S.O.P Administration Training is one part of government agencies that require special training which includes learning and direct practice of SOP preparation.

METHOD

This research uses research and development method (Research & Development) or R&D methods. This study was conducted on 20 new employees who worked in the preparation of government Administration SOP in Human Ressources Development of Bukittinggi in 2019. The data tested in this study were (1) product validity taken using a validation instrument in the form of a validation sheet and assessed by media experts, material experts , and linguists, (2) the practicality of the blended learning model, which was taken with a practicality questionnaire which contained the perceptions of participants, filled in by participants and facilitators, the aspects assessed were the convenience and attractiveness of the media used; (3) the effectiveness of the blended learning model that is based on the learning outcomes of students, the results of this learning in the form of aspects of knowledge and aspects of participant skills obtained using facilitators observation and pretest and post-test.

The product developed in this study is a blended learning model which combines online learning and face-to-face learning for training in the Governement Administrative SOP developer. The development phase consists of six stages, namely (1) development of curriculum and teaching materials, (2) explanation to mentors or employees's supervisor, (3) web development and small group trials, (4) improvement and medium groups trials, (5) Implementation of learning; (6) Evaluation.

Development and curriculum stages include the preparation of modules and learning media. Modules were adapted from training modules that were previously conducted face-to-face which were then refined and adjusted, especially in the pre-test and post-test sections. The learning media compiled in the form of a short video guide of each material by the facilitator and then followed by power point material in one video.

Explanation directly to the participant's facilitator or supervisor with the aim of providing an understanding to the participant's superior and explanation of his responsibility for the success of the participants' learning.

Web development and small group trial, Good curriculum learning tools, teaching materials and websites that are ready to be used need to be validated by content experts, the media and language. After improvement, the instrument was tested for practicality by small group participants (3 people) and facilitators.

Improvement and medium group trial, after the improvement of teaching materials, websites and curriculum are done, they are being tested on medium groups and mentors.

Implementation of Learning, the implementation of learning in one class that contains 20 participants. The last stage is evaluation.

RESULT

After the blended learning model is done, the validity, practicality, and effectiveness of blended learning are obtained. The results of the research carried out are described as follows.

DEVELOPMENT OF CURRICULUM AND TEACHING MATERIALS

Curriculum development is carried out by adjusting the Education and Training Program Design and Training Design. The learning objectives of the training did not adjust with the aim of ensuring the equality of graduate competencies. Table 1 shows the comparison of face-to-face education and training curriculum changes with blended learning.

Tabel 1. Comparison of Face-to-Face Training and Blended Learning Curriculum

Part of differences	Face to Face Training	Blended Learning
Duration of lesson	50 Hours	39 Hours
Learning Method	Seminar, Question and Answer, Independent practice	Listening video, reading learning material, group practice, Question and Answer using communication media.
Learning Media	Power point slide, Flipchart	Website contain video and nonprinted learning material.

The learning video was developed with several technical stages which are: (1) The recording process was carried out in the office where the educator worked, the Yogyakarta Regional Human Resources Development Center. (2) Editing, editing and merging of videos recorded with cameras and applications is carried out with Sony Vegas Pro. While non-printed teaching materials or reading material with .pdf file extension was developed by scanning the printed teaching materials used previously with editing some words, images and letters layout so that teaching materials become

readable.

EXPLANATION TO MENTORS AND EMPLOYEE BOSSES

Explanation or socialization to mentors and employee superiors was carried out with the aim of asking for support for the implementation of this research. In dissemination of the research, The researcher explained about the task of mentors in providing supervision to participants who are their subordinates about the standard operational procedures that will be used as training material for participants.

WEB DEVELOPMENT AND SMALL GROUP TRIALS

There are 4 stages of web development process:

A. Hosting and domain setup. Hosting and domains were created through the Hoster Commerce service provider that provides unlimited personal packages for hosting. www.diklatmasadepankdn.com was chosen as the domains name used in learning web development. This was done on January 4, 2019.

B. Web development. Development is carried out on the display, navigation and forum. Developers used moodle which is used commonly in web learning development. Besides installing the original moodle application package, the developer also added a theme or theme in moodle, Shiksha theme. The purpose of adding the theme is to enrich the function of the web so that it can provide needs especially in question banks, question and answer menus and assessments. Display the main page of the web that is the main on the web namely the Question and Answer menu and the problem menu.

C. Web material filling. Filling the web with non-printed teaching materials and videos is done by the author with guidance from the web developer.

D. Media, language and material validation. The author submits media, language and material validation by experts. Media validation is done to determine the validity of the web used. The media validator checks the developed web and follows the percentage of media validation in the SOP preparation training with blended learning.

Table 2. Media Validation Results

No	Aspects	Score (%)	Category
1	Convenient of the website media	75	Valid
2	Text on the website is easy to read	100	Very Valid
3	The selected menu can display content quickly	75	Valid
4	Videos can be played quickly.	75	Valid
5	Website can be accessed easily	75	Valid
6	Website address is easy to remember.	75	Valid
7	Navigation on the website is going well.	75	Valid

8	The Forum menu works fine.	100	Sangat Valid
9	The log in menu worksproperly	100	Sangat Valid
10	The log out menu works properly	100	Sangat Valid
11	User profile menu to see the user's profile going well	100	Sangat Valid
12	The menu for editing user information is functioning properly.	75	Valid
13	Practice questions can be downloaded.	75	Valid
14	The results of the practice score can be seen	75	Valid
15	The language used was written according to the proper grammar based on Indonesian language guideline	75	Valid
16	Text / writing on the website is easy to read	75	Valid
17	Simple website display design	50	Quite Valid
18	Website display design is attractive for users / participants.	75	Valid
19	Web colors selection were good	100	Very Valid
20	The selection of images on the web is good.	100	Very Valid
21	The use of video in explaining the training material is appropriate.	75	Valid
22	Video quality in learning media is good.	75	Valid
23	The quality of the narration used in the video is good	75	Valid
24	The use of music in the video is good.	75	Valid
25	The selection of menu and navigation layout in the web is good	75	Valid
26	The use of web layouts is consistent.	75	Valid
Sum			2100
Mean			80,77
Category			Valid

Table 2 shows the results of media validation conducted by media experts. The validation results show that the media used in this study is valid with a score of 80.77%. Every point in the validation criterion shows a score of $\geq 75\%$ which indicates that in each media criterion used is valid.

Table 3. Language Validation Results

No	Aspect	Score (%)	Category
1	The language used was written according to the proper grammar based on Indonesian language guideline	100	Very Valid
2	The sentences used are easy to understand .	100	Very Valid
3	The sentence used is not ambiguous	100	Very Valid
4	The language used is communicative.	100	Very Valid
5	The sentences used are easy to understand for independent learning .	100	Very Valid
6	The use of simple language so that messages from the training material are delivered	100	Very Valid
7	The terms used are consistent so it's easy to understand.	100	Very Valid
8	The task instructions sentence is easy to understand	100	Very Valid
9	The test instructions sentence is easy to understand.	100	Very Valid
Sum		900	
Mean		100	
Category			Very Valid

Table 3 shows that the language used is easy to understand so that the intention and purpose are easy to achieve by obtaining score of 100%. Each criterion of language validation is very valid.

Table 4. Material Validation Result

No	Aspect	Score (%)	Category
1	The learning material on the media / website is presented systematically	100	Very Valid
2	Material on the media / website is presented logically	100	Very Valid
3	The instructions for using the media / website are clear	100	Very Valid
4	The material on the media / website is easy to be studied independently	100	Very Valid
5	Participants are assumed to be able to use the media / website in learning	100	Very Valid
6	The questions used are in accordance with the training curriculum	100	Very Valid
7	The material presented is in accordance with the training curriculum	100	Very Valid
8	The assignments presented are in accordance with the training curriculum	100	Very Valid
9	The term is used according to education and training	100	Very Valid
10	The video presented can help participants understand the material.	100	Very Valid
Sum			1000
Mean			100
Category			Very Valid

Table 4 shows the results of the validation of the material used in this study. This validation was carried out by the Head of the Competency Development Division for Functional Positions, Implementers, Regional Heads, Deputy Regional Heads, DPRD, and Lurah and since 2013 who has developed face-to-face SOP training. The validator checks the web and asks a number of questions related to the suitability of the Education and Training Program Design. Validation results show the average for all aspects is 100% thus the material in the media developed for learning used in SOP training with blended learning is the same as face-to-face training developed by the team chaired by the validator.

Table 5. Practicality Results in Small Group Trial

No	Aspect	Score (%)	Category
1	Website is very accessible on a computer or laptop	75	Practical
2	The language used on the website is easy to understand	75	Practical
3	Navigation buttons on the website are easy to use	66,67	Practical
4	The material on the website is easy to understand	75	Practical
5	The material on the website is presented sequentially and completely	66,67	Practical
6	Presentation and image and video quality is good	66,67	Practical
7	The layout of the presentation of the material is good and appropriate	75	Practical
8	Websites facilitate the understanding of the training material	75	Practical
9	Convenient online discussion	66,67	Practical
10	The evaluation / question sentences in online learning are easy to understand	66,67	Practical
11	The material on the website can help independent learning	75	Practical
12	Use of a website can increase learning motivation	75	Practical

Sum	853,33
Mean	71,53
Category	Practical

Table 5 shows the results of the practicality test of blended learning conducted in small groups. The results showed that the average for all aspects was 71.53% thus that the media developed for learning was declared as practical website.

IMPROVEMENT AND MEDIUM GROUP TRIALS

The learning media is improved according to the suggestions of the media validator, language, material, and advice from small groups. Then the practicality of the media was again tested to the medium group which were 20 learning participants and facilitators. The results were as follows.

Table 6. Practicality Results in Medium Group Trial

No	Aspect	Score (%)	Category
1	Website is very accessible on a computer or laptop	87,5	Very Practical
2	The language used on the website is easy to understand	83,75	Very Practical
3	Navigation buttons on the website are easy to use	82,5	Very Practical
4	The material on the website is easy to understand	82,5	Very Practical
5	The material on the website is presented sequentially and completely	86,25	Very Practical
6	Presentation and image and video quality is good	83,75	Very Practical
7	The layout of the presentation of the material is good and appropriate	83,75	Very Practical
8	Websites facilitate the understanding of the training material	83,75	Very Practical
9	Convenient online discussion	82,5	Very Practical
10	The evaluation / question sentences in online learning are easy to understand	85	Very Practical
11	The material on the website can help independent learning	86,25	Very Practical
12	Use of a website can increase learning motivation	85	Very Practical
Sum		1012,5	
Mean		84,37	
Category			Very Practical

Table 6 shows that the results of the web media practicality test after the group made improvements were very practical. The practicality score increased from 71.53% to 84.37%. This means that web media can be used for the learning process of blended learning.

In addition to being tested for practicality in medium groups, the website is also examined by facilitator in terms of practicality. The result is as follows.

Table 7. Practicality Result by Facilitator

No	Aspect	Score (%)	Category
1	Website works properly (not error)	100	Very Practical
2	Program instruction on website is easy to understand.	75	Practical
3	Navigation buttons on the website are easy to use	100	Very Practical
4	Websites can reduce the burden on facilitators in delivering repetitive material	100	Very Practical
5	Videos on the website can help participants understand the training material.	75	Practical
6	The backgrounds used on the website are interesting	75	Practical
7	Attractive website color	75	Practical
8	Discussion forums give participants the opportunity to have an opinion	75	Practical
9	Discussion forums increase interactivity between participants and participants as well as with the facilitator	75	Practical
10	The evaluation / question sentence is easy to understand	75	Practical
11	Giving test scores through the website is easy	75	Practical
12	The use of a website increases learning motivation	75	Practical
13	Website material makes it easy for participants to learn independently	100	Very Practical
Sum			1075
Mean			82,69
Category			Very Practical

Table 7 shows that the facilitator assessed that the web was very practical to be used for education and training through the blended learning method. The score obtained is 82.69% which shows that web media is very practical. In addition, every aspect of the web assessment scores $\geq 75\%$.

IMPLEMENTATION OF LEARNING

Learning activities began on January 10 to January 23, 2020. Learning begins by providing an explanation of the blended learning used in education and training. As set forth in the curriculum or Design and Education and Training Programs, participants will go through a face-to-face learning and online learning. Face-to-face and online learning and then ends with pre test, post test and skill assessment. Skill assessment is a way to determine the ability of participants to analyze S.O.P that has been made by participants. Participants are asked to analyze the writing errors of S.O.P and how to correct them so that participants are expected not to make the same mistakes on other occasions. The results of the pre-test, post-test used as an assessment of the significance of training to increase participant's knowledge while the skills test is used as an assessment of the effectiveness of the training because from the beginning the training was intended to provide practical abilities in preparing S.O.P.

EVALUATION

The results of the evaluation are carried out by assessing the effectiveness

of the training through the blended learning method. Evaluation is based on pre-experimental design especially one-group pretest-posttest design with assessed knowledge participants' competencies and one-shot case study with assessed skill participants' competencies.

Table 8. Result of Pre-test and Post-test

	Pre-Test	Post-Test
Mean	54,70956522	97,97304348

Table 8 shows that mean of post-test score increase from pre-test score about 43,26 points. This means that the preparation of S.O.P training for government administration with blended learning is effective to increase participants' knowledge. The knowledge gained by the participants from the education and training is the basis for participants to get S.O.P. The preparation skills are shown in the following table.

Table 9. Result of Skill Assessment

Name	Skill Assessment		Category	Conversion
	Score	%		
WZ	90	90	Excellent	Very effective
AF	92	92	Excellent	Very effective
YS	90	90	Excellent	Very effective
RM	80	80	Good	Effective
JM	87	87	Good	Effective
YA	85	85	Good	Effective
SO	86	86	Good	Effective
MS	84	84	Good	Effective
RW	86	86	Good	Effective
SR	84	84	Good	Effective
RB	83	83	Good	Effective
EP	82	82	Good	Effective
MRE	84	84	Good	Effective
AW	84	84	Good	Effective
CE	81	81	Good	Effective
FA	83	83	Good	Effective
YN	84	84	Good	Effective
RE	82	82	Good	Effective
ES	81	81	Good	Effective
AR	82	82	Good	Effective
ASP	83	83	Good	Effective
LO	82	82	Good	Effective
LF	82	82	Good	Effective
Mean		84,61%	Good	Good

The average results of the skills assessment were 84.61% which mean that the participants achieve the tailored goals. The conversion to the effectiveness category indicates that the blended learning is effective method for Civil officer training. The results of the knowledge and skills assessment of the S.O.P of Government Administration staff training showed significant and effective results.

DISCUSSION

Another result obtained in this study is that the budget required for the blended learning training method is reduced by 60% compared to conventional face-to-face training. In addition, this method reduces the required learning hours so that it does not interfere with SCO tasks and functions in their organization.

Based on the results of studies conducted show that the method of blended learning training for SCO is valid, practical and effective in increasing the knowledge and competencies of participants. Blended learning is a method developed by online learning methods and on the site training. This study is in accordance with a study conducted by Prayitno (2015) who identified the application of blended learning in education and training for educators and education staff was be very helpful in efforts to improve the competency and professionalism of educators and education personnel by reducing the time and cost. This can happen because the online system makes it easy for someone to learn from anywhere so that it saves space and time which mean reducing transport and accommodation cost without reducing its effectiveness in increasing knowledge (Bakri, 2010). Other studies showed that simulation methods or direct practice supervised by facilitator allow participants to directly practice of what has been learned into a real implementation (Rahmana, Arief et al., 2016; Swasto, 2011). Musa & Khasanah (2019) found that the learning outcomes of craftsmanship and entrepreneurship taught using moodle-based e-learning media are higher than students who are taught using printed media. Other study found the result of group accounting learning which is taught using e-learning learning strategy is significantly higher than that taught using expository learning strategy in students who have high learning interest (Kristiyani & Budiningsih, 2019). Meanwhile, an effective blended learning environment is necessary in undertaking innovative pedagogical approaches through the use of technology in teaching and learning (Kintu, Zhu, & Kagambe, 2017).

CONCLUSIONS

The training method with blended learning system is a method that can be applied to replace the face-to-face method in SCO Training. Blended learning methods are effective, practical, and valid for use. In addition, the advantage of this method is that it is very cost effective in terms of cost and time budget. This method can fulfill the mandate of the law on the obligation of SCO for training without sacrificing the duties and functions of the SCO at the institution where SCO works. The implementation of this training can run if participants can actively learn independently. Study in a larger group is needed in developing a blended learning training model for SCO and identify its effectiveness in larger group.

REFERENCES

- Bakri, M. A. (2010). Pengembangan program pembelajaran online berbasis LMS untuk keterampilan pemecahan masalah di PT. Indosat Tbk. *RESULTAN Jurnal Kajian Teknologi*, 10(01). Retrieved from <http://jurnal.unismabekasi.ac.id/index.php/resultan/article/view/514>
- Hoffman, J. (2014). *Blended Learning Instructional Design: A Modern Approach*. Boston: InSync Training.
- Kintu, M. J., Zhu, C., & Kagambe, E. (2017). Blended learning effectiveness : the relationship between student characteristics , design features and outcomes. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-017-0043-4>
- Kristiyani, E., & Budiningsih, I. (2019). Pengaruh strategi pembelajaran e-learning dan minat belajar terhadap hasil belajar akuntansi. *Akademika Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 8(1), 57–69.
- Musa, & Khasanah. (2019). Pengaruh penggunaan media e-learning berbasis moodle dan minat belajar terhadap hasil belajar prakarya dan kewirausahaan. *Akademika Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 8(1), 1–11.
- Nguyen, T. (2015). The Effectiveness of Online Learning: Beyond No Significant Difference and Future Horizons. *MERLOT Journal of Online Learning and Teaching*, 11(2). Retrieved from http://jolt.merlot.org/Vol11no2/Nguyen_0615.pdf
- Peraturan Pemerintah RI No. 11. *Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil (Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2017 Nomor 63, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 6037)*. , Pub. L. No. 11 (2017).
- Peraturan Pemerintah RI No. 63. *Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 63 Tahun 2016 Tentang Jenis Dan Tarif Atas Jenis Penerimaan Negara Bukan Pajak Yang Berlaku Pada Badan Kepegawaian Negara (Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2016 Nomor 309, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Repu. , Pub. L. No. 63 (2016)*.
- Prayitno, W. (2015). *Penerapan blended learning dalam pengembangan Pendidikan dan Pelatihan (diklat) bagi pendidik dan tenaga kependidikan (PTK)*. Retrieved from http://lpmpjogja.kemdikbud.go.id/wpcontent/uploads/2015/08/Artikel-br_10juli-Penerapan-BlendedLearning-dalam-Pengembangan-Diklat-PTK_Wendhie.pdf
- Rahmana, Arief et al. (2016). Efektivitas Model Pelatihan Berbasis Simulasi dalam Meningkatkan Kompetensi Manajemen Proyek Karyawan Industri Manufaktur. *Seminar Nasional IENACO – 2016*. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/303722283_Efektivitas_Model_Pelatihan_Berbasis_Simulasi_Dalam_Meningkatkan_Kompetensi_Manajemen_Proyek_Karyawan_Industri_Manufaktur

- Saranapengaspalan.com. (2018). Harga Pengaspalan Terbaru 2017 – 2018. Retrieved September 1, 2018, from <https://www.saranapengaspalan.com/2016/05/harga-pengaspalanterbaru.html>
- Smilanich, E., & Wilson, D. (2005). *Other Blended Learning*. San Francisco: Pfeiffer.
- Swasto, B. (2011). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Malang: Universitas Brawijaya Press (UB Press).
- Thorne, K. (2003). *Blended learning: how to integrate online and traditional learning*. Great Britain and the United States: Kogan Page Limited.
- Undang-Undang RI No. 20. *Undang-undang Nomor 20 Tahun 1997 tentang Penerimaan Negara Bukan Pajak (Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1997 Nomor 43, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Nomor 3687)*. , Pub. L. No. 20 (1997).
- Watson, J. (2008). *Blending Learning: The Convergence of Online and Face-toFace Education*. Vienna: N.A.C.O.L.
- Zhong, Z.-H., Zhang, Q.-B., Li, Z.-P., & Liu, Y. (2016). Motivations and Challenges in MOOCs with Eastern Insights. *International Journal of Information and Education Technology*, 6(12), 954–960.